

انواع التناص في فيلم "الكلمات"

Types of Intertextuality in the Movie "The Words"

م.م. نبراس ابراهيم محمود

Asst. Lect. Nibras Ibrahim Mahmood

مديرية تربية صلاح الدين

General Directorate of Education in Salah Al-Deen

E-mail: nmahmood@st.tu.edu.iq

أ.د. انسام رياض المعروف

Prof. Dr. Ansam Riyadh Almaaroorf

كلية التربية للبنات _ جامعة تكريت

Tikrit University-College of Education for Women

E-mail: Sbc.s5@tu.edu.iq

الكلمات المفتاحية: التناص، روبرت مايولا، فيلم الكلمات، همنغواي، الحقيبة.

Keywords: intertextuality, Robert S. Miola, *The Words* movie, Hemingway, briefcase.

الملخص

من الصعب في هذه الأيام العثور على أي عمل فني أصيل دون أن يتأثر بأنواع أدبية أخرى. تهدف هذه الدراسة إلى مناقشة بعض أنواع التواصل في فيلم الكلمات. تعتمد هذه الأنواع على كتاب روبرت س. ميولا "الأنواع السبعة للتواصل" (٢٠٠٤) والذي تم اعتماده كمنهجية في هذه الدراسة لمعرفة كيفية تأثير النصوص التواصلية على حبكة الفيلم وشخصياته وحواره. إن التواصل في الفيلم اتاح له التواصل والتشابه مع الأنواع الأدبية الأخرى، سواء في الأسلوب أو اللغة أو التقنية أو الصورة. أظهرت النتائج أن التضمين العرضي لفقدان المخطوطة في الفيلم التي ستكون السبب وراء نجاح الشخصية الرئيسية، هو المصدر الرئيسي لبناء حبكة الفيلم التي تتداخل مع الحادثة الحقيقية لفقدان الحقيبة التي تحتوي على الكثير من الأعمال الأدبية الغير منشورة للكاتب الشهير إيرنست همنغواي في باريس. يعزز التواصل في هذا الفيلم مصداقيته من خلال إعادة صياغة حادثة فقدان الحقيبة في سيناريو جديد بحيث يجعلها جوهر الألم والنجاح لكثير من الناس. ليست هذه هي الإشارة الوحيدة لهمنغواي، فالرجل العجوز في الكلمات يستذكر "الشيخ والبحر"، و"الشمس تشرق أيضًا" لمساعدة الشخصية الرئيسية على تسجيل عواطفه على الورق والسماح له بأن يصبح كاتبًا مرة واحدة وإلى الأبد.

Abstract

It is hard nowadays to find any original artistic work without being influenced by other genres. This study aims to discuss some types of intertextuality in The Words movie (2012). These types are based on Robert S. Miola's Seven Types of Intertextuality (2004) which are adopted as a methodology in this study to find out how the intertextual texts have affected the storyline, characterization, narration, and dialogue of this movie. Intertextuality allows the movie to interweave with other genres, whether in style, language, technique, or image. The results show that the main source to build the plot of the movie is the accidental inclusion of the lost manuscript, which will be the reason behind the success of the main character, is intertextual with the real accident of Ernest Hemingway's lost briefcase in Paris that has many of his unpublished works. Intertextuality in this movie enhances its credibility by reformulating the accident of losing the briefcase in a new scenario to make it the core of pain and success for many people. This is not the only clue for Hemingway, the Old Man in The Words recalls The Old Man and The Sea, and The Sun Also Rises to help the main character record his passions on paper and let him be a writer once for good.



1-Introduction

Intertextuality means the influence of a text on another one. It involves the correlation or the presence of similarities between one text and another or among several texts either from the past or contemporary ones. According to Julia Kristeva, a French linguist, all texts are intertextual in one way or another either politically or socially. She asserts that a text may be read in several ways and interpreted into many meanings. Yet, it is difficult for us to take control of this meaning unless we involve our imagination. Kristeva coined the term intertextuality in 1966 and since that time it has come to have as many meanings as its users (Allen, 2006). She relies upon Bakhtin's notion of 'dialogism', which indicates that any speech or statement has either been said before or attached to an associated textual condition. According to Kristeva, each text is a mosaic of quotations; any text is the absorption and the transformation of another (ibid). Thus, intertextuality is similar to restructuring an old text and modernizing it. Recently the term intertextuality has been linked strongly with movies. Most filmmakers built the plot of their movies on the ground of other resources whether literary, scientific, religious, or even cultural traditions and prevalent beliefs. Every writer or director is inspired by previous texts which can also help them create more nuanced conversations around their films.

According to Robert S. Miola's Seven Types of Intertextuality "These resources set not only the plot but also characters, ideas, language or style to later texts so the interior text helps in shaping the posterior text in various ways" (2004, p. 14). Intertextuality in movies is sometimes direct or indirect. Directly when the author on purpose wants the audience to make a link or realize something. Indirectly means that the author is unavoidably inspired by another text or another artist's style. Either way, it depends on the audience's acquaintance with the original work to get the distinction and impact between the two different versions. (Nordquist, 2020). Literary works are no longer solely about conveying meaning or expressing an author's thoughts, but they can have a variety of integrated relationships with other works and linguistic aspects .

2- Robert S. Miola's Seven Types of Intertextuality

In his study, Robert S. Miola traces the variety of intertextual interactions between modern literature and that of Shakespeare including sources and influences. He focuses on the wide and distinguished meaning of intertextuality instead of looking for what he refers to as "different voices in the same text" which is strongly adhered to by Kristeva, Barthes, and Derrida, where the conscious and unconscious echoes are not brought into account. Miola distinguishes seven types of intertextuality, though the number is not fixed, subdivided into three categories, according to three



main criteria: first, the degree to a previous text's trace is marked by linguistic reflection; second, the degree to which its impact is dependent on the audience awareness; and third, how much this interaction is controversial.

Category 1 includes the author's interference subconsciously more than consciously and purposefully through revision, allusion, translation, quotation, and sources of specific books or texts. Reading, performing, and remembering could be subconscious more than conscious or intentional. The textual interaction appears in the form of a verbal reflection or a non-verbal one throughout the theme or style. Type 1 concerns with Revision and the relationship between the anterior and posterior texts is similar to the father-son relationship "where the latter takes identity from the former." Here the reviser due to his tendency and intention and not for cultural and social reasons, as the editors presume, offers a new scenario throughout different dilemmas and issues, though some of the audience may consider it an illegal interference. The reviser keeps the title and most of the text while altering the language, setting, and names of the characters while adding or deleting here and there to fit a definite time for a definite purpose. Intertextuality becomes an adaptation when the time distance is too long between the two texts but still, the formatted text helps in the rebirth of the latter. In revision, the interaction is straightforward, deliberate, and selective, with evidence of the reviser's orientation and willingness. Type 2 concerns Translation it is when a text is renewed by transmitting it into another language. The subsequent text openly claims the original's identity. The difficulty lies in the uncrossable cultural and linguistic scope between culture and language.

Quotation is type 3, in which the former text (total or part) is transcribed into a later text "in effect, quotation without variable iteration, quotation as a reference, not a re-enactment." (Miola, 2004) The quotation could be analyzed by the readers either grammatically or pragmatically concerning place, time, medium, function, even textual illusion is a type of quotation. They are employed as segments in the later text either for commenting on or clarifying what is ambiguous in the text. Critically, the quotation has an evocative importance in a context where evocation is only viewed through its connection with other quotations .

Type 4 Sources, intertextuality by sources means that the later text adopts the plot, character, idea, language, style, form, or content of the former text. In other words, the source text participates in shaping the latter through content, form, and style. However, three subdivisions can be determined, the source coincidence, where the earlier text exists effectively in the later one as if it is derived from it, so the earlier text comes to life



with a new personality but recognizing the earlier text is part of understanding the later one. The source proximate is the most famous kind of intertextuality. Here the author “honors, reshapes, steals, ransacks and plunders” the source freely. It includes verbal and non-verbal traces of the former source. Some critics think that this transaction is really deleterious to the action. The source remote, where sources or influences are not vividly traced and listed under this category. It encompasses any text that the author has read or known even classical stories and grammar school texts, so it is a matter of reading and remembering depending on the subconsciousness of the author. So, the intertextual work to some extent is subjective.

Category 2 is where the original text imposes its identity through commentaries, adaptations, and translations in other texts along with many other original texts as part of traditions taking the form of expected reactions or reflexes. Type 5 conventions and configurations, especially in poetry and drama. It means the traditions and conventions of classical, medieval, or continental literary works that are adapted by writers, especially poetry, such as Senecan conventions in tragedy and Plautine and Terentian conventions in comedy. Type 6, Genera. Indicates that intertextuality includes any underlying or outright connections to any selected genera, for example, the play within the play. Category 3, is the audience contribution in the text. Cesare Segre has called this kind of intertextuality, "interdiscursivity"; which he explains as the cultural and ideological connections that any oral text or written hold with other texts. The audience rather than the author will disclose those connections to other texts. Type 7 Paralogues are any texts that elucidate the meanings in other texts ideologically, socially, theologically, or politically. Thus, the intentions and attitudes of the author are not as important as the analogical connection with other texts.

3-Synopsis of The Words movie

The Words is an American movie released in (2012), written and directed by Brian Klugman and Lee Sternthal. On watching it, one can see how unbelievable luck can play such a magnificent role in shaping the destiny of an aspiring New York writer whose noncommercial novels have been rejected many times. The life of Rory Jansen (Bradley Cooper) with his girlfriend Dora (Zoe Saldana) has always been supported financially by his father Mr. Jansen. At the time Mr. Jansen asks Rory to take responsibility and find a job, his legs lead him to a publishing house where he works as a clerk. He marries Dora and spends his honeymoon in Paris where she buys him an old briefcase in a jumble sale. His life was changed as they came back home to New York. During his search in that briefcase,



he finds a hidden old manuscript tells the story of a young man called Jack (Ben Barnes) .

The story enchants Rory and he decides to publish it and overnight it becomes a bestseller and Rory is now a famous writer. Unfortunately, the dream doesn't last long and his success is short-lived. One day, an old man (Jeremy Irons) follows Rory to Central Park asking for an autograph when he starts telling him the real story of loss and pain behind writing that manuscript. When the old man was a young man living in France as a soldier in the U.S. Army, he fell in love with Celia (Nora Arnezeder) a French waitress. They eventually married and had a daughter, who later died. Unable to cope with the loss, Celia left him and moved to her parents' home in the country. He then used his pain as inspiration to write the manuscript, which he took to Celia while visiting her. She found the story so moving she returned to him. However, she unintentionally left the manuscript in a briefcase on the train after her trip back to Paris and lost it. Because of this, their reconciliation was short-lived, and they divorced soon afterwards. Rory is now obliged to face the truth and encounter the consequences of his actions and pay the cost of claiming that the story is his, but in fact it was the old man's happiness, pain, words and life.

4-Discussion

The plot of The Words movie is intertextual with many themes, illusions, and quotations from many sources. Intertextuality through revision is vividly present in the German movie Lila Lila (2004) which is based on a novel by Martin Suter. The plot of The Words bears striking similarities to the story of the stolen authorship promise which is prominent in both movies. In Lila Lila, David, a waiter finds unpublished manuscripts in a dress drawer. To impress Maria who is a literature student whom he admires, he claims to be an author. At that time only, the real author introduces himself and begins to take over David's life. The title of the movie

The Words may be intertextual through translation with the title of that same German movie Lila Lila, which is My Words, My Lies, My Love (2009). (<https://m.imdb.com/title/tt1239449>)

For those who have read about Hemingway's life, at watching The Words movie, they can see many references to this great American writer, either directly or indirectly. The Words is intertextual through source coincidence with the accident of losing Hemingway's briefcase. Hemingway was on his way to Switzerland to attend the peace conference in Geneva as a reporter while his wife, Hadley Richardson, was in Paris where they used to live. Later, she packed for the trip to Switzerland after his insistence. She decided to bring all his writings so that he could share



them with Lincoln Steffens. But what has really happened next is that the briefcase was stolen in the train and the manuscript had never been retrieved. (J. Gerald Kennedy, 1991) .

The Words movie has dealt with this idea in a witty way. The thought of finding a manuscript or a book in a briefcase accidentally by a man who wants to prove first to himself, his girl, and his parents that he is a successful writer, is presented in a different scenario, besides using different problems, different points of view to give the movie a new shape and signification. There is a direct reference to Hemingway where we can find his name on the pledge of the antique store and in that very store where Rory's wife, Dora, buys him an old briefcase and it happens to have the manuscript which will be his luck stone since later he gets famous and makes his own books published after they have been rejected many times. The writer of the movie wants to tell us that this briefcase might be Hemingway's lost one, or might be another writer who has gained his fame from the lost works of Hemingway, so the writer creates a story built on this illusion which is another type of intertextuality.

As soon as the name Hemingway appears, the audience will unconsciously link the portrait of the old man in the movie with the old man 'Santiago' in *The Old Man and the Sea*, not only in the way he looks as a man who has been taught very hard lessons in life, a man with many experiences who has suffered a lot during his lifetime but also as a man who never gives up and stays faithful to his wife along with his words. When Rory asks him "... but what happened?" The old Man answers bitterly "Life", (Klugman and Sternthal, 2012, 50:02) a word for a thousand. It just comes to our minds the words of the old man 'Santiago', "A man is not made for defeat" he said, "A man can be destroyed but not defeated". In *The Words*, although the old man is broken within, he insists on chasing Rory and telling him the story of his loss for the most valuable and dearest things to him; his wife, his daughter, and his words. He could have left everything going easily and kept silent but the feeling that his work is fruitful and appreciated gives meaning to his wasted life as if he achieves victory in the end even if that costs him a lot. He resembles Santiago who suffers to save his reputation as a fisherman in his chasing for the big fish to give meaning to his existence because for him the battle with the fish is an existential one to prove his humanity to the limit.

There is intertextuality in the source remote between Hemingway's *The Old Man and the Sea* and Rory in *The Words* for both are writers. Many critics have said that *The Old Man and the Sea* is of great importance to Hemingway and his literary career as a writer. His preceding book *Across the River and into the Trees* doesn't achieve much critical success



so he depends on The Old Man and the Sea to save his reputation as a writer. On the other hand, Rory fails to publish his two books which leads him to frustration. He tells his wife "I am not who I was, okay? I am not. And I'm terrified that I never will be" (ibid, 21: 37). So, he hung on The Words as the only way out of his hopeless situation and to be the writer he ever so long had dreamed of.

One of the most obvious examples of intertextuality in The Words is the movie's usage of quotations from notable writers and thinkers. These quotations are utilized to give insight into the characters' thoughts and motives, as well as commentary on the movie's themes and concepts. There is another intertextuality through quotation in Hemingway's novel *The Sun Also Rises* (1926). This quotation is evidence of Rory's difficulties with identity and self-worth, as well as a reference to Hemingway's impact on the literary world .

The intertextual connection between *The Words* and *The Sun Also Rises* through source coincidence is evident when the beautiful French wife Celia abandons Jack, he gets so angry that he shatters his books everywhere, but accidentally his sight falls on Hemingway's book "*The Sun Also Rises*", which is a novel about an American expatriate who has wounded during the war and stayed in Paris. It resembles to some extent Jack as a man who fights in the war and then moves to Paris, gets married, and has a daughter who gets sick and dies. Her death causes much pain and disagreement between him and his wife and later leads Celia to leave the house with a letter telling him that she is going to stay with her mother. This makes him lose his mind but as soon as Jack has glimpsed the book of Hemingway *The Sun Also Rises*, he gets calm and starts writing his words. He writes what he feels and what he can't say. The title of the novel may give hope and delight because there will be a new generation and new lives as long as the sun rises, but it also indicates an ironic meaning that the former generation will die .

In *The Sun Also Rises*, Hemingway barely develops the interior lives of his main characters. He conveys the lives of the expatriates as empty and meaningless, depicting them as the Lost Generation. He even uses this epigraph to remark *The Sun Also Rises*, in which he is credited to Gertrude Stein for coining this term. (Bracken, 2024) Stein influenced Hemingway with her writing style and made him use the term Lost Generation in many of his novels. Her name appears on the first page of the manuscript as a reference to her part in Hemingway's life but in the movie, her character can be intertextual through source remote with Celia because she inspired him to write his words. The Old Man says "My



tragedy was that I loved the words more than the woman who inspired me to write them"(Klugman and Sternthal, 2012,1:26:49).

The intertextuality of Hemingway's works doesn't stop here, there is a quotation from another novel by Hemingway which is *Up in Michigan* which can be seen on the first page of the manuscript when Rory starts to read it, precisely extracted from chapter 2:

When they came to our flat, they seemed to like us even more; but perhaps that was because the place was so small and we were much closer together. Mrs. Stein sat on the bed that was on the floor and asked to see the stories I had written and she said that she liked them except one called *Up in Michigan*. (qtd in Del Gizzo, S. 2009)

Hemingway's *Up in Michigan* is a short story written early in 1921 as a part of Hemingway's memoir *A Moveable Feast* that depicts his life as an unknown writer living in Paris. His memories there are full of passion and wit. Hemingway's life in Paris as an expatriate affected his career as a writer, he says "if you are lucky enough to have lived in Paris as a young man, then, wherever you go for the rest of your life it stays with you, for Paris is a moveable feast." (qtd in Smith, 1985, p: 165). Both works *The Words* and *Moveable Feast*, in which *Up in Michigan* is part of, are the memoirs of their writers. Enrolling this extract within the lost manuscript is intertextual through sources proximate to the lost works of Hemingway. The old man doesn't seem outraged about Jansen's plagiarism as he should be, and actually, Hemingway describes the accident of his lost manuscripts as "juvenile work" and fortunately Hadley has saved a few carbons, among which is the short story *Up in Michigan*, a kind of a brilliant work that leaves us wondering how genius the lost works could be. (ibid)

All these interference with Hemingway either by his real-life incidents or by his works make the audience suspect the real identity of Clay Hammond, whether he is Hemingway himself, although the appearance of the old man won't prove this assumption. Involving the audience in analyzing the character of the writer and suspecting his identity, as well as opening the way for them to notice the connection between this movie and other texts leaves the movie in category 3 of Miola's intertextuality.

Another form of intertextuality in *The Words* is through source proximate. The movie makes several allusions to famous works of literature, including *The Great Gatsby* and *Wuthering Heights*. These references improve the story by adding context and complexity to the characters' experiences. For example, when Rory's wife, Dora, realizes that he plagiarized his manuscript, she calls him Jay Gatsby from *The Great Gatsby*. This analogy emphasizes Rory's ambition for achievement and his



readiness to compromise his ethics in order to attain it. The intertextual link between *The Words* and *Wuthering Heights* is clear through the issue of plagiarism and the repercussions of copying someone else work. Heathcliff is accused of stealing Mr. Earnshaw's property in *Wuthering Heights*, and of attempting to destroy his own and others' lives. Similarly in *The Words*, Rory's plagiarism causes his downturn and the end of his writing career.

Intertextuality through quotation can be also seen in the wise saying "Be a man" It's a well-known fragment; in fact, lots of songs and movies adopt it. The most prominent speech is that of Jack Nicholson in his movie *As Good As It Gets* when he says "I want to be a better man for you" (Klugman and Sternthal, 2012, 1:15:20) addressing his girlfriend. Rory's father tells his son to be a man taking responsibility and giving up his pride. Obviously, Rory takes his father's advice by doing whatever it takes to make not only his life easier but also the lives of those he loves. Rory is a man of target and dreams but when his potential is not enough to reach his target, he chooses to steal other's potential. He chooses to be a plagiarist in order to make his dream come true despite the pressure and consequences that he chooses to live with for the rest of his life. The old man told him "You chose the words; you chose the pain" (ibid, 1:22:59). The movie highlights how words can influence people's lives profoundly, both positively and negatively. Besides it shows how the words can be used as a tool to deceive and manipulate others.

Intertextuality through genre can be seen in the form of a frame story or frame narrative. It is a distinctive literary device used by many writers in which additional story is added within the main story, sometimes the main story serves as an introduction and conclusion for the frame story but sometimes it plays a larger role. In *The Words* movie, the narration style is very important to make the story more realistic and touchable. The frame story or the story within the story narrative is not something new in literature and many writers have adopted this technique, for example Bronte's *Wuthering Heights* or Chaucer's *The Canterbury Tales*. However, a story within a story within a story can be seen in Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* where there are three separate narrators. Shelley starts with a framing narrative of Walton's letter to his sister before moving to the main narrative Victor's story and then contained within this is the Monster's story of survival and how he learns from the De Lacey family (Shelley, 2012).

A story within a story within a story technique has been intelligently used in this movie. The action sequence is serially narrated through the reading of Clay Hammond and later the Old Man's tale. Narrative consequence transmits the audience from the outer and recent narrative of Hammond's reading of his latest successful book to the inner and earliest



narrative of the Old Man's tale and between this and that you find Rory's tale. Thus, the audience is exposed to various situations between past and present, getting their emotions involved and at the same time leaving them wondering if Rory and Clay are one character or not, it is a confusing end. Finally, intertextuality through conventions serves the moral lesson behind this movie which is people make mistakes every day but they should undertake the consequences. The old man told Rory "We all make choices in life; the hard thing is to live with them". He doesn't care whether Rory admits his mistake or not because he knows that his guilt will accompany him as long as he lives, it is poetic justice.

Conclusion

Miola's Seven Types of Intertextuality has shown that The Words movie is intertextual with several texts. Intertextuality is used extensively to create a complex and layered narrative that draws on a variety of literary sources. Starting with the title of the movie The Words which is intertextual with the German movie Lila Lila since the plot of The Words is also intertextual through revision with that German movie. A main source for the plot is the real-life episode of Hemingway's lost briefcase, which is intertextual through source coincidence with The Words. In fact, it is closer to Hemingway than Lila Lila or Wuthering Heights since there are many quotations, allusions, and references to the writer Ernest Hemingway starting with Jack's job as a reporter in Paris just like Hemingway, and then the antiques shop that carries Hemingway's name which is in Paris too. As well as alluding to Hemingway's novels The Sun Also Rises and The Old Man and The Sea. Source proximate and source remote are evident through the traces of both Wuthering Heights and Great Gatsby. Through quotation, we get a deeper understanding and a wider perspective of the text that we can touch those sources in many aspects and feel their impact in a way that the writer wants us to recall Hemingway all along the movie. Intertextuality through genre with other frame stories, like Shelley's Frankenstein in its multilayered narrative, serves the credibility of the actions. The Words exemplifies how intertextuality may improve the reading experience and bring deeper insights into the human condition. Consequently, the movie creates a rich and complex narrative that explores themes of identity, creativity, and morality .



References

- Allen, Graham. (2006). Intertextuality. London: Routledge. p. 53 – Bracken, H. (2024, March 6). The Sun Also Rises. Encyclopedia Britannica).
<https://www.britannica.com/topic/The-Sun-Also-Rises>
- Del Gizzo, S. (2009). Redefining Remate: Hemingway’s Professed Approach to Writing A Moveable Feast. The Hemingway Review, 28(2), p.121-126.
<https://doi.org/10.1353/hem.0.0035>.
- J. Gerald Kennedy (1991). Hemingway's Gender Trouble. American Literature, 63(2), p.187-207. doi:10.2307/2927161
- Klugman, Brian and Lee Sternthal. (2012). The Words (film). CBS Films .
<https://www.16.0123movie.net/movie/the-words-9082.html>
- Miola, Robert S. (2004). Seven Types of Intertextuality. Shakespeare, Italy, and Intertextuality. part 1, p.13-25
<https://loyolanotredamelib.org/Chaired/docs/SevenTypesIntextuality-04.pdf>
- Nordquist, Richard. (2020). Intertextuality. Definition and Examples. p.10
<https://www.thoughtco.com/what-is-intertextuality-1691077>
- Shelley, M.W. (2012). The Annotated Frankenstein. USA: Harvard University Press .
- Smith, P. (1985). Three Versions of “Up in Michigan,”. Resources for American Literary Study, 15(2), p.163-177.

